

BILL, RECORD LECTURE!!!!

BILL RECORD LECTURE!!!

The Infinite Can Ramsey Thm: Mileti's Proof

William Gasarch-U of MD

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Is there a proof that is similar in spirit to the proof of Inf Ramsey?

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Is there a proof that is similar in spirit to the proof of Inf Ramsey?

Yes. It is due to Joseph Miletic.

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Is there a proof that is similar in spirit to the proof of Inf Ramsey?

Yes. It is due to Joseph Miletic.

1. His interest: He got a more constructive proof of Can Ramsey.

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Is there a proof that is similar in spirit to the proof of Inf Ramsey?

Yes. It is due to Joseph Miletic.

1. His interest: He got a more constructive proof of Can Ramsey.
2. My interest: educational.

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Is there a proof that is similar in spirit to the proof of Inf Ramsey?

Yes. It is due to Joseph Miletic.

1. His interest: He got a more constructive proof of Can Ramsey.
2. My interest: educational.
3. My interest: better bounds when finitized.

Recap

We gave two proofs of Inf Can Ramsey:

- ▶ One used 4-ary Ramsey and 1-d Can Ramsey.
- ▶ One used 3-ary Ramsey, 1-d Can Ram, and Maximal Sets.

Is there a proof that is similar in spirit to the proof of Inf Ramsey?

Yes. It is due to Joseph Miletic.

1. His interest: He got a more constructive proof of Can Ramsey.
2. My interest: educational.
3. My interest: better bounds when finitized.
4. This finitization has never been written up. Will be an extra credit project.

Min-Homog, Max-Homog, Rainbow

Def: Let $COL : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \omega$. Let $V \subseteq \mathbb{N}$. Assume $a < b$ and $c < d$.

- ▶ V is *homog* if $COL(a, b) = COL(c, d)$ iff *TRUE*.
- ▶ V is *min-homog* if $COL(a, b) = COL(c, d)$ iff $a = c$.
- ▶ V is *max-homog* if $COL(a, b) = COL(c, d)$ iff $b = d$.
- ▶ V is *rainb* if $COL(a, b) = COL(c, d)$ iff $a = c$ and $b = d$.

Can Ramsey Thm for $\binom{\mathbb{N}}{2}$: For all $COL : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \omega$, there exists an infinite set V such that either V is homog, min-homog, max-homog, or rainb.

Notation

$(\exists^\infty x \in A)$ means **for an infinite number of $x \in A$**

Notation

$(\exists^\infty x \in A)$ means **for an infinite number of $x \in A$**

$(\forall^\infty x \in A)$ means **for all but a finite number of $x \in A$**

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

One of the following happens:

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

One of the following happens:

▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) = c]$.

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

One of the following happens:

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) = c]$.
Kill all those who disagree. $COL'(x_1) = (H, c)$.
Similar to 1st step of Inf Ramsey.

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

One of the following happens:

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) = c]$.
Kill all those who disagree. $COL'(x_1) = (H, c)$.
Similar to 1st step of Inf Ramsey.
- ▶ $(\forall c \in \omega)(\forall^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) \neq c]$. For every color c the set of y with $COL(x_1, y) = c$ is finite.

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

One of the following happens:

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) = c]$.
Kill all those who disagree. $COL'(x_1) = (H, c)$.
Similar to 1st step of Inf Ramsey.
- ▶ $(\forall c \in \omega)(\forall^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) \neq c]$. For every color c the set of y with $COL(x_1, y) = c$ is finite.
Kill duplicates, so in new set $COL(x_1, ?)$ are all different.
 $COL'(x_1) = (RB, 1)$. Similar to proof of 1-ary Can Ramsey.

First Step of Construction

The following notation will make later cases similar to this case.

$$V_1 = \mathbb{N}$$

$$x_1 = 1$$

Have $COL : \binom{V_1}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

One of the following happens:

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) = c]$.
Kill all those who disagree. $COL'(x_1) = (H, c)$.
Similar to 1st step of Inf Ramsey.
- ▶ $(\forall c \in \omega)(\forall^\infty y \in V_1)[COL(x_1, y) \neq c]$. For every color c the set of y with $COL(x_1, y) = c$ is finite.
Kill duplicates, so in new set $COL(x_1, ?)$ are all different.
 $COL'(x_1) = (RB, 1)$. Similar to proof of 1-ary Can Ramsey.

In both cases let

V_2 be the new infinite set.

x_2 be the least element of V_2 .

Second Step of Construction

Have V_2 and x_2 .

Have $COL : \begin{pmatrix} V_2 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix} \rightarrow \omega$.

Second Step of Construction

Have V_2 and x_2 .

Have $COL : \binom{V_2}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) = c]$. Then restrict to that set and color x_2 with (H, c) . Similar to 2nd step of Inf Ram.

Second Step of Construction

Have V_2 and x_2 .

Have $COL : \binom{V_2}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) = c]$. Then restrict to that set and color x_2 with (H, c) . Similar to 2nd step of Inf Ram.
- ▶ $(\forall c \in \omega)(\forall^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) \neq c]$.

Second Step of Construction

Have V_2 and x_2 .

Have $COL : \binom{V_2}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) = c]$. Then restrict to that set and color x_2 with (H, c) . Similar to 2nd step of Inf Ram.
- ▶ $(\forall c \in \omega)(\forall^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) \neq c]$.
 - ▶ For every color c the set of y with $COL(x_2, y) = c$ is finite. Kill duplicates so that $COL(x_2, ?)$ are all different. New set is W . Will not be final V_3 .

Second Step of Construction

Have V_2 and x_2 .

Have $COL : \binom{V_2}{2} \rightarrow \omega$.

- ▶ $(\exists c \in \omega)(\exists^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) = c]$. Then restrict to that set and color x_2 with (H, c) . Similar to 2nd step of Inf Ram.
- ▶ $(\forall c \in \omega)(\forall^\infty y \in V_2)[COL(x_2, y) \neq c]$.
 - ▶ For every color c the set of y with $COL(x_2, y) = c$ is finite. Kill duplicates so that $COL(x_2, ?)$ are all different. New set is W . Will not be final V_3 .
 - ▶ $COL'(x_2) = (RB, 1)$ if x_1 and x_2 are **similar**.
 $COL'(x_2) = (RB, 2)$ if x_1 and x_2 are **different**.
See next slide.

Convention

When we say (H, j) we think of j as a color.
We also say $j \in \omega$.

Convention

When we say (H, j) we think of j as a color.

We also say $j \in \omega$.

When we say (RB, j) we think of j as an index.

We also say $j \in \mathbb{N}$.

Convention

When we say (H, j) we think of j as a color.

We also say $j \in \omega$.

When we say (RB, j) we think of j as an index.

We also say $j \in \mathbb{N}$.

Really $\omega = \mathbb{N}$ so they are all numbers.

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

Note following

- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_1, w_3), \text{COL}(x_1, w_4), \dots$ are all different.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_2, w_3), \text{COL}(x_2, w_4), \dots$ are all different.

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

Note following

- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_1, w_3), \text{COL}(x_1, w_4), \dots$ are all different.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_2, w_3), \text{COL}(x_2, w_4), \dots$ are all different.

One of the following occurs.

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

Note following

- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_1, w_3), \text{COL}(x_1, w_4), \dots$ are all different.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_2, w_3), \text{COL}(x_2, w_4), \dots$ are all different.

One of the following occurs.

1. $(\exists^\infty w \in W)[\text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)]$. Then let $V_3 = \{w \in W : \text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)\}$.

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

Note following

- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_1, w_3), \text{COL}(x_1, w_4), \dots$ are all different.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_2, w_3), \text{COL}(x_2, w_4), \dots$ are all different.

One of the following occurs.

1. $(\exists^\infty w \in W)[\text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)]$. Then let
 $V_3 = \{w \in W : \text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)\}$.
 $\text{COL}'(x_2) = (\text{RB}, 1)$.

Note that $(\forall y \in V_3)[\text{COL}(x_1, y) = \text{COL}(x_2, y)]$ & $|V_3| = \infty$

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

Note following

- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_1, w_3), \text{COL}(x_1, w_4), \dots$ are all different.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_2, w_3), \text{COL}(x_2, w_4), \dots$ are all different.

One of the following occurs.

1. $(\exists^\infty w \in W)[\text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)]$. Then let $V_3 = \{w \in W : \text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)\}$.
 $\text{COL}'(x_2) = (\text{RB}, 1)$.

Note that $(\forall y \in V_3)[\text{COL}(x_1, y) = \text{COL}(x_2, y)]$ & $|V_3| = \infty$

2. $(\exists^\infty w \in W)[\text{COL}(x_1, w) \neq \text{COL}(x_2, w)]$. Then let $V_3 = \{w \in W : \text{COL}(x_1, w) \neq \text{COL}(x_2, w)\}$.

$\text{COL}'(x_1), \text{COL}'(x_2) \in \{(\text{RB}, 1), (\text{RB}, 2)\}$

$$W = \{w_3, w_4, \dots, \}$$

Note following

- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_1, w_3), \text{COL}(x_1, w_4), \dots$ are all different.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(x_2, w_3), \text{COL}(x_2, w_4), \dots$ are all different.

One of the following occurs.

1. $(\exists^\infty w \in W)[\text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)]$. Then let $V_3 = \{w \in W : \text{COL}(x_1, w) = \text{COL}(x_2, w)\}$.
 $\text{COL}'(x_2) = (\text{RB}, 1)$.

Note that $(\forall y \in V_3)[\text{COL}(x_1, y) = \text{COL}(x_2, y)]$ & $|V_3| = \infty$

2. $(\exists^\infty w \in W)[\text{COL}(x_1, w) \neq \text{COL}(x_2, w)]$. Then let $V_3 = \{w \in W : \text{COL}(x_1, w) \neq \text{COL}(x_2, w)\}$.
 $\text{COL}'(x_2) = (\text{RB}, 2)$.

Note that $(\forall y \in V_3)[\text{COL}(x_1, y) \neq \text{COL}(x_2, y)]$ & $|V_3| = \infty$

Third Step, i th Step

V_3 is defined and is infinite. x_1, x_2 are colored.
 x_3 is least element of V_3 .

Third Step, i th Step

V_3 is defined and is infinite. x_1, x_2 are colored.

x_3 is least element of V_3 .

HW: Do third step.

Third Step, i th Step

V_3 is defined and is infinite. x_1, x_2 are colored.

x_3 is least element of V_3 .

HW: Do third step.

After third step

$\text{COL}'(x_3) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \leq 3\}$.

V_4 will be infinite.

Third Step, i th Step

V_3 is defined and is infinite. x_1, x_2 are colored.

x_3 is least element of V_3 .

HW: Do third step.

After third step

$\text{COL}'(x_3) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \leq 3\}$.

V_4 will be infinite.

V_i is defined and is infinite. x_1, \dots, x_{i-1} are colored.

x_i is least element of V_i .

Third Step, i th Step

V_3 is defined and is infinite. x_1, x_2 are colored.

x_3 is least element of V_3 .

HW: Do third step.

After third step

$\text{COL}'(x_3) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \leq 3\}$.

V_4 will be infinite.

V_i is defined and is infinite. x_1, \dots, x_{i-1} are colored.

x_i is least element of V_i .

HW: Do i th step.

Third Step, i th Step

V_3 is defined and is infinite. x_1, x_2 are colored.

x_3 is least element of V_3 .

HW: Do third step.

After third step

$\text{COL}'(x_3) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \leq 3\}$.

V_4 will be infinite.

V_i is defined and is infinite. x_1, \dots, x_{i-1} are colored.

x_i is least element of V_i .

HW: Do i th step.

After i th step

$\text{COL}'(x_i) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \leq i\}$.

V_{i+1} will be infinite.

ω th Step, Case 1

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

ω th Step, Case 1

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

For all $x \in X$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

ω th Step, Case 1

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

For all $x \in X$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Key We started with $\text{COL} : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \omega$ and now have
 $\text{COL}' : X \rightarrow \omega$.

ω th Step, Case 1

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

For all $x \in X$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Key We started with $\text{COL} : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \omega$ and now have $\text{COL}' : X \rightarrow \omega$.

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

$$H = \{x \in X : \text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)\}$$

ω th Step, Case 1

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

For all $x \in X$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Key We started with $\text{COL} : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \omega$ and now have $\text{COL}' : X \rightarrow \omega$.

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

$$H = \{x \in X : \text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)\}$$

COL restricted to $\binom{H}{2}$ is always color c_0 .

ω th Step, Case 1

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

For all $x \in X$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(RB, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Key We started with $\text{COL} : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \omega$ and now have $\text{COL}' : X \rightarrow \omega$.

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

$$H = \{x \in X : \text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)\}$$

COL restricted to $\binom{H}{2}$ is always color c_0 .

H is homog of color c_0 .

ω th Step, Case 2

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

ω th Step, Case 2

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbf{N}\}$.

ω th Step, Case 2

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

Eliminate Duplicates to get

ω th Step, Case 2

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$
 $\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_i) = (H, c_i)$ with c_i 's different.

ω th Step, Case 2

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$
 $\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(H, j) : j \in \omega\} \cup \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_i) = (H, c_i)$ with c_i 's different.

H is min-homog.

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

If neither happens then H only occurs finite often as 1st coordinate.

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

If neither happens then H only occurs finite often as 1st coordinate.
Eliminate those finite x such that $\text{COL}'(x) = (H, ?)$.

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

If neither happens then H only occurs finite often as 1st coordinate.

Eliminate those finite x such that $\text{COL}'(x) = (H, ?)$.

Keep the name of the set X too avoid to much notation.

If Cases 1,2 Do Not Occur Then ...

Case 1 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\exists c_0 \in \omega)(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (H, c_0)].$$

Case 2 H occurs inf often as 1st coordinate and

$$(\forall c)(\forall^\infty x)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (H, c)].$$

If neither happens then H only occurs finite often as 1st coordinate.

Eliminate those finite x such that $\text{COL}'(x) = (H, ?)$.

Keep the name of the set X too avoid to much notation.

For Cases 3,4 assume $(\forall x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (\text{RB}, ?)]$.

ω th Step, Case 3

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

ω th Step, Case 3

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$
 $\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

ω th Step, Case 3

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Case 3 $(\exists i_0 \in \mathbb{N})(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (\text{RB}, i_0)]$.

$$H = \{x \in X : \text{COL}'(x) = (\text{RB}, i_0)\}$$

ω th Step, Case 3

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

Case 3 $(\exists i_0 \in \mathbb{N})(\exists^\infty x \in X)[\text{COL}'(x) = (\text{RB}, i_0)]$.

$$H = \{x \in X : \text{COL}'(x) = (\text{RB}, i_0)\}$$

H is max-homog.

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$
 $\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_j) = (\text{RB}, c_j)$ with c_j 's different.

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_j) = (\text{RB}, c_j)$ with c_j 's different.

So where are we now?

Let $a < b < c$.

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_j) = (\text{RB}, c_j)$ with c_j 's different.

So where are we now?

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of h_a to the right, are different from each other.

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_j) = (\text{RB}, c_j)$ with c_j 's different.

So where are we now?

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of h_a to the right, are different from each other.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(h_a, h_c) \neq \text{COL}(h_b, h_c)$.

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_j) = (\text{RB}, c_j)$ with c_j 's different.

So where are we now?

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of h_a to the right, are different from each other.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(h_a, h_c) \neq \text{COL}(h_b, h_c)$.

So is H a rainbow set?

ω th Step, Case 4

Recap We have $X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots\}$

$\text{COL}'(x) \in \{(\text{RB}, j) : j \in \mathbb{N}\}$.

If Case 1,2,3 do not occur then have:

Case 4

$(\forall x)(\forall^\infty i)[\text{COL}'(x) \neq (\text{RB}, i)]$. Eliminate Duplicates to get

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

where $\text{COL}'(h_j) = (\text{RB}, c_j)$ with c_j 's different.

So where are we now?

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of h_a to the right, are different from each other.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(h_a, h_c) \neq \text{COL}(h_b, h_c)$.

So is H a rainbow set?

No. Counterexample on next slide.

Counterexample Due to Liam Gerst

$$\text{COL} : \binom{M}{2} \rightarrow \omega$$

Countexample Due to Liam Gerst

$$\text{COL} : \binom{M}{2} \rightarrow \omega$$

$$\text{COL}(i, j) = |i - j|$$

Let $a < b < c$.

Countexample Due to Liam Gerst

$$\text{COL} : \binom{M}{2} \rightarrow \omega$$

$$\text{COL}(i, j) = |i - j|$$

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of a to the right are different from each other.

Counterexample Due to Liam Gerst

$$\text{COL} : \binom{M}{2} \rightarrow \omega$$

$$\text{COL}(i, j) = |i - j|$$

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of a to the right are different from each other.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(a, c) \neq \text{COL}(b, c)$.

ωth Step, Case 4 (cont)

Recap

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

Let $a < b < c$.

ω th Step, Case 4 (cont)

Recap

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of h_a to the right are different from each other.

ω th Step, Case 4 (cont)

Recap

$$H = \{h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots\}$$

Let $a < b < c$.

- ▶ All of the edges out of h_a to the right are different from each other.
- ▶ $\text{COL}(h_a, h_c) \neq \text{COL}(h_b, h_c)$.

Claim For all $i \in \mathbb{N}$, c a color, $\deg_c(h_i) \leq 2$.

Proof Assume, BWOC that $\deg_c(h_i) \geq 3$.

Case 1 There two vertices x, y to the right of h_i such that $\text{COL}(h_i, x) = \text{COL}(h_i, y) = c$. This contradicts that all the edges coming out of h_i are different.

Case 2 There two vertices x, y to the left of h_i such that $\text{COL}(x, h_i) = \text{COL}(y, h_i) = c$. This contradicts that x and y disagree.

End of Proof of Claim

Last Step: Another Construction

Recall

Lemma Let X be infinite. Let $COL : \binom{X}{2} \rightarrow \omega$. Let $d \in \omega$. If for every $x \in X$ and $c \in \omega$, $\deg_c(x) \leq d$ then there is an infinite rainbow set.

We apply this to our set H with $d = 2$ to get a rainbow set.