

## The Distinct Volumes Problem

David Conlon- Cambridge (Prof)

Jacob Fox-MIT (Prof)

William Gasarch-U of MD (Prof)

David Harris- U of MD (Grad Student)

Douglas Ulrich- U of MD (Ugrad Student)

Sam Zbarsky- Mont. Blair. (High School Student- now CMU)

# Darling Wants an Actual Coloring

1. **Infinite Ramsey Thm:** For any 2-coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite *monochromatic*  $K_\omega$ .

# Darling Wants an Actual Coloring

1. **Infinite Ramsey Thm:** For any 2-coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite *monochromatic*  $K_\omega$ .
2. **Infinite Can Ramsey Thm:** For any  $\omega$ -coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite  $H$  such that either (1)  $H$  homog, (2)  $H$  min-homog, (3)  $H$  max-homog, (4)  $H$  rainbow.

# Darling Wants an Actual Coloring

1. **Infinite Ramsey Thm:** For any 2-coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite *monochromatic*  $K_\omega$ .
2. **Infinite Can Ramsey Thm:** For any  $\omega$ -coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite  $H$  such that either (1)  $H$  homog, (2)  $H$  min-homog, (3)  $H$  max-homog, (4)  $H$  rainbow.
3. **Darling:** Give me an **example** of an actual coloring.

# Darling Wants an Actual Coloring

1. **Infinite Ramsey Thm:** For any 2-coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite *monochromatic*  $K_\omega$ .
2. **Infinite Can Ramsey Thm:** For any  $\omega$ -coloring of the EDGES of  $K_\omega$  there exists an infinite  $H$  such that either (1)  $H$  homog, (2)  $H$  min-homog, (3)  $H$  max-homog, (4)  $H$  rainbow.
3. **Darling:** Give me an **example** of an actual coloring.

**Bill** thinks of one— next page.

# Points and Distances

Let  $p_1, p_2, \dots$  be an infinite set of points in  $\mathbb{R}$ .

# Points and Distances

Let  $p_1, p_2, \dots$  be an infinite set of points in  $\mathbb{R}$ .

Let  $COL : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be

$$COL(i, j) = |p_i - p_j| \text{ (Distance Between } p_i \text{ and } p_j).$$

# Points and Distances

Let  $p_1, p_2, \dots$  be an infinite set of points in  $\mathbb{R}$ .

Let  $COL : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be

$$COL(i, j) = |p_i - p_j| \text{ (Distance Between } p_i \text{ and } p_j).$$

**Result:** For any infinite set of points in the plane there is an infinite subset where all distances are distinct. (Already known by Erdős via diff proof.)



# Points and Distances

Let  $p_1, p_2, \dots$  be an infinite set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ .

Let  $COL : \binom{\mathbb{N}}{2} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be

$$COL(i, j) = |p_i - p_j| \text{ (Distance Between } p_i \text{ and } p_j).$$

**Result:** For any infinite set of points in the plane there is an infinite subset where all distances are distinct. (Already known by Erdős via diff proof.)

**Next Step:** Finite version: Can use Finite Can Ramsey to prove the following: For every set of  $n$  points in the plane there is a subset of size  $\Omega(\log n)$  where all distances are distinct. (Much better is known.)

# INITIAL MOTIVATION ABANDONED

# INITIAL MOTIVATION ABANDONED

1. Dumped Ramsey! Added co-authors! Got **new** results!

# INITIAL MOTIVATION ABANDONED

1. Dumped Ramsey! Added co-authors! Got **new** results!
2. What about **Area**? If there are  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  want large subset so that all areas are distinct.

# INITIAL MOTIVATION ABANDONED

1. Dumped Ramsey! Added co-authors! Got **new** results!
2. What about **Area**? If there are  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  want large subset so that all areas are distinct.
3. More general question:  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  and looking for all  $a$ -volumes to be different. (This question seems to be new.)

# EXAMPLES with DISTANCES

The following is an **EXAMPLE** of the kind of theorems we will be talking about.

*If there are  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  then there is a subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$  with all distances between points **DIFF**.*

# EXAMPLES with AREAS

*If there are  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  then there is a subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$  with all triangle areas **DIFF**.*

## EXAMPLES with AREAS

*If there are  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  then there is a subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$  with all triangle areas **DIFF**.*

**FALSE:** Take  $n$  points on a LINE. All triangle areas are 0.



# EXAMPLES with AREAS

*If there are  $n$  points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  then there is a subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$  with all triangle areas **DIFF**.*

**FALSE:** Take  $n$  points on a LINE. All triangle areas are 0.

We state theorems in **no three collinear** form to get around this issue.

# Maximal Rainbow Sets

**Def:** A **(2)-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all of the distances are distinct. Also called a **dist-rainbow**.

# Maximal Rainbow Sets

**Def:** A **(2)-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all of the distances are distinct. Also called a **dist-rainbow**.

**Def:** A **3-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero areas of triangles are distinct. Also called an **area-rainbow**.

# Maximal Rainbow Sets

**Def:** A **(2)-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all of the distances are distinct. Also called a **dist-rainbow**.

**Def:** A **3-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero areas of triangles are distinct. Also called an **area-rainbow**.

**Def:** An  **$a$ -Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero  $a$ -volumes are distinct. An  $a$ -volume is the volume enclosed by  $a$  points. Also called a **vol-rainbow**.

# Maximal Rainbow Sets

**Def:** A **(2)-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all of the distances are distinct. Also called a **dist-rainbow**.

**Def:** A **3-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero areas of triangles are distinct. Also called an **area-rainbow**.

**Def:** An  **$a$ -Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero  $a$ -volumes are distinct. An  $a$ -volume is the volume enclosed by  $a$  points. Also called a **vol-rainbow**.

**Def:** Let  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$ . A **Maximal Rainbow Set** is a rainbow set  $Y \subseteq X$  such that if any more points of  $X$  are added then it STOPS being a rainbow set.

# Maximal Rainbow Sets

**Def:** A **(2)-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all of the distances are distinct. Also called a **dist-rainbow**.

**Def:** A **3-Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero areas of triangles are distinct. Also called an **area-rainbow**.

**Def:** An  **$a$ -Rainbow Set** is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  where all nonzero  $a$ -volumes are distinct. An  $a$ -volume is the volume enclosed by  $a$  points. Also called a **vol-rainbow**.

**Def:** Let  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$ . A **Maximal Rainbow Set** is a rainbow set  $Y \subseteq X$  such that if any more points of  $X$  are added then it STOPS being a rainbow set.

**Def:** Let  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$ . An  **$a$ -Maximal Rainbow Set** is a  $a$ -rainbow set  $Y \subseteq X$  such that if any more points of  $X$  are added then it STOPS being an  $a$ -rainbow set.

# Easy Lemma

**Lemma** If there is a MAP from  $X$  to  $Y$  that is  $\leq c$ -to-1 then  $|Y| \geq |X|/c$ .

We will call this LEMMA.

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .



# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.  
Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ?

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? It's  $\leq 1$  POINT.

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? It's  $\leq 1$  POINT.

What is  $f^{-1}(x_1, \{x_2, x_3\})$ ?

# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? It's  $\leq 1$  POINT.

What is  $f^{-1}(x_1, \{x_2, x_3\})$ ? It's  $\leq 2$  POINTS.



# The $d = 1$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ , or
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? It's  $\leq 1$  POINT.

What is  $f^{-1}(x_1, \{x_2, x_3\})$ ? It's  $\leq 2$  POINTS.

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2} \text{ is } \leq 2\text{-to-1.}$$

## The $d = 1$ Case- Cont

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$  is  $\leq 2$ -to-1.

## The $d = 1$ Case- Cont

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$  is  $\leq 2$ -to-1.

**Case 1:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/3}$  DONE!

# The $d = 1$ Case- Cont

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$  is  $\leq 2$ -to-1.

**Case 1:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/3}$  DONE!

**Case 2:**  $|M| \leq n^{1/3}$ . So  $|X - M| = \Theta(|X|)$ . By LEMMA

$$\begin{aligned} |\binom{M}{2} + M \times \binom{M}{2}| &\geq 0.5|X - M| = \Omega(|X|) = \Omega(n) \\ |M| &\geq \Omega(n^{1/3}) \end{aligned}$$

# On Circle

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^1$  (the circle) of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .

**Proof:** Use **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**. Similar Proof.

# Better is known

Better is known: In 1975 Komlos, Sulyok, Szemerédi showed:

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^1$  or  $\mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .

# Better is known

Better is known: In 1975 Komlos, Sulyok, Szemerédi showed:

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^1$  or  $\mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .

This is optimal in  $\mathbb{S}^1$  and  $\mathbb{R}^1$

# Better is known

Better is known: In 1975 Komlos, Sulyok, Szemerédi showed:

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^1$  or  $\mathbb{R}^1$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .

This is optimal in  $\mathbb{S}^1$  and  $\mathbb{R}^1$

**Thm:** If  $X = \{1, \dots, n\}$  then the largest dist-rainbow subset is of size  $\leq (1 + o(1))n^{1/2}$ .



# The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

## The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.  
Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

# The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ .

# The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ?

## The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? Lies on LINE.

# The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? Lies on LINE.

What is  $f^{-1}(x_1, \{x_2, x_3\})$ ?

# The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? Lies on LINE.

What is  $f^{-1}(x_1, \{x_2, x_3\})$ ? Lies on CIRCLE.

# The $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x - x_2|]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[|x - x_1| = |x_2 - x_3|]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})$ ? Lies on LINE.

What is  $f^{-1}(x_1, \{x_2, x_3\})$ ? Lies on CIRCLE.

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.



## The $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.  $\delta$  TBD.

Cases 1 and 2 induct into line and circle case.

**Case 1:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2)[(f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a line, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

## The $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.  $\delta$  TBD.

Cases 1 and 2 induct into line and circle case.

**Case 1:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a line, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 2:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, \{x_2, x_3\}\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a circle, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

## The $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.  $\delta$  TBD.

Cases 1 and 2 induct into line and circle case.

**Case 1:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a line, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 2:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, \{x_2, x_3\}\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a circle, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 3:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/6}$  DONE!

## The $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.  $\delta$  TBD.

Cases 1 and 2 induct into line and circle case.

**Case 1:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a line, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 2:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, \{x_2, x_3\}\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a circle, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 3:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/6}$  DONE!

**Case 4:** Map is  $\leq n^\delta$ -to-1 AND  $|X - M| = \Theta(|X|)$ . By LEMMA

## The $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.  $\delta$  TBD.

Cases 1 and 2 induct into line and circle case.

**Case 1:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a line, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 2:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, \{x_2, x_3\}\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a circle, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 3:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/6}$  DONE!

**Case 4:** Map is  $\leq n^\delta$ -to-1 AND  $|X - M| = \Theta(|X|)$ . By LEMMA

$$\begin{aligned} |\binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}| &\geq n/n^\delta = n^{1-\delta} \\ |M| &\geq \Omega(n^{(1-\delta)/3}) \end{aligned}$$

## The $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}$$

All INVERSE IMG's lie on LINES or CIRCLES.  $\delta$  TBD.

Cases 1 and 2 induct into line and circle case.

**Case 1:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a line, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 2:**  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3)[|f^{-1}(\{x_1, \{x_2, x_3\}\})| \geq n^\delta]$ .

$\geq n^\delta$  points on a circle, so rainbow set size  $\geq \Omega(n^{\delta/3})$ .

**Case 3:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/6}$  DONE!

**Case 4:** Map is  $\leq n^\delta$ -to-1 AND  $|X - M| = \Theta(|X|)$ . By LEMMA

$$\begin{aligned} |\binom{M}{2} \cup M \times \binom{M}{2}| &\geq n/n^\delta = n^{1-\delta} \\ |M| &\geq \Omega(n^{(1-\delta)/3}) \end{aligned}$$

Set  $\delta/3 = (1 - \delta)/3$ .  $\delta = 1/2$ . Get  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

# On Sphere

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^2$  (surface of sphere) of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Use **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**. Similar Proof.

# On Sphere

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^2$  (surface of sphere) of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/6})$ .

**Proof:** Use **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET**. Similar Proof.

**Note:** Better is known: Charalambides showed  $\Omega(n^{1/3})$ .



# General $d$ Case

## Thm:

For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n \exists$  dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^d$  of size  $n \exists$  dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

# General $d$ Case

## Thm:

For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n \exists$  dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^d$  of size  $n \exists$  dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Proof:** Use **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET** and induction.  
Need result on  $\mathbb{S}^d$  and  $\mathbb{R}^d$  to get result for  $\mathbb{S}^{d+1}$  and  $\mathbb{R}^{d+1}$ .

# General $d$ Case

## Thm:

For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n \exists$  dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{S}^d$  of size  $n \exists$  dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Proof:** Use **MAXIMAL DIST-RAINBOW SET** and induction.  
Need result on  $\mathbb{S}^d$  and  $\mathbb{R}^d$  to get result for  $\mathbb{S}^{d+1}$  and  $\mathbb{R}^{d+1}$ .

**Note:** Better is known. In 1995 Thiele showed  $\Omega(n^{1/(3d-2)})$ . But WE improved that!

## General $d$ Case- Much Better

**Thm:** For all  $d \geq 2$ , for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(3d-3)}(\log n)^{\frac{1}{3} - \frac{2}{3d-3}})$ .

# General $d$ Case- Much Better

**Thm:** For all  $d \geq 2$ , for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(3d-3)}(\log n)^{\frac{1}{3}-\frac{2}{3d-3}})$ .

**Proof:** Use **VARIANT ON MAX DIST-RAINBOW SET**

$d$	$n^{1/3d}$	$n^{1/(3d-3)}(\log n)^{\frac{1}{3}-\frac{2}{3d-3}}$
1	$n^{1/3}$	--
2	$n^{1/6}$	$n^{1/3}(\log n)^{-1/3}$
3	$n^{1/9}$	$n^{1/6}(\log n)^0$
4	$n^{1/12}$	$n^{1/9}(\log n)^{1/12}$
5	$n^{1/15}$	$n^{1/12}(\log n)^{1/6}$
6	$n^{1/18}$	$n^{1/15}(\log n)^{1/5}$

## General $d$ Case- Much Better

**Thm:** For all  $d \geq 2$ , for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a dist-rainbow subset of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(3d-3)}(\log n)^{\frac{1}{3}-\frac{2}{3d-3}})$ .

**Proof:** Use **VARIANT ON MAX DIST-RAINBOW SET**

$d$	$n^{1/3d}$	$n^{1/(3d-3)}(\log n)^{\frac{1}{3}-\frac{2}{3d-3}}$
1	$n^{1/3}$	--
2	$n^{1/6}$	$n^{1/3}(\log n)^{-1/3}$
3	$n^{1/9}$	$n^{1/6}(\log n)^0$
4	$n^{1/12}$	$n^{1/9}(\log n)^{1/12}$
5	$n^{1/15}$	$n^{1/12}(\log n)^{1/6}$
6	$n^{1/18}$	$n^{1/15}(\log n)^{1/5}$

Can we do better? Best we can hope for is roughly  $n^{1/d}$ .

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.



## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

## Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ? SEE NEXT SLIDE FOR GEOM LEMMA.

# Lemma On Area

**Lemma:** Let  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  be lines in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ .

$$\{p : \text{AREA}(L_1, p) = \text{AREA}(L_2, p)\}$$

is a line.



# Lemma On Area

**Lemma:** Let  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  be lines in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ .

$$\{p : \text{AREA}(L_1, p) = \text{AREA}(L_2, p)\}$$

is a line.

**Sketch:**  $\text{AREA}(L_1, p) = \text{AREA}(L_2, p)$  iff

$|L_1| \times |L_1 - p| = |L_2| \times |L_2 - p|$  iff  $\frac{|L_1 - p|}{|L_2 - p|} = \frac{|L_1|}{|L_2|}$ . This is a line.

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .



## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ?

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ?

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4, x_5\})$ ?

## (Reboot) Area- $d = 2$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear,  $\exists$  area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5})$ .

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .


$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ . Recall that

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4, x_5\})$ ? By Lemma all points on it are on a line- so  $\leq 2$  points. FINITE.

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$  FINITE-to-1. 

## Area $d = 2$ Case- Cont

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$  is FINITE-to-1.

**Case 1:**  $|M| \geq n^{1/5}$  DONE!

**Case 2:**  $|M| \leq n^{1/5}$ . Then  $|X - M| = \Theta(|X|)$ . Since MAP is finite-to-1, by LEMMA

$$\begin{aligned} |\binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}| &\geq \Omega(|X - M|) = \Omega(|X|) = \Omega(n) \\ |M| &\geq \Omega(n^{1/5}) \end{aligned}$$



## Volume $d = 3$

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no four on a plane, there exists Vol-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)  
Similar. Left for the reader.

# KEY to These Proofs

# KEY to These Proofs

1. Used **MAXIMAL  $a$ -RAINBOW SET**  $M$ .

# KEY to These Proofs

1. Used **MAXIMAL  $a$ -RAINBOW SET**  $M$ .
2. Used Map  $f$  from  $x \in X - M$  to the reason  $x$  is NOT in  $M$ .

# KEY to These Proofs

1. Used **MAXIMAL  $a$ -RAINBOW SET**  $M$ .
2. Used Map  $f$  from  $x \in X - M$  to the reason  $x$  is NOT in  $M$ .
3. Looked at **INVERSE IMAGES** of that map.

# KEY to These Proofs

1. Used **MAXIMAL  $a$ -RAINBOW SET**  $M$ .
2. Used Map  $f$  from  $x \in X - M$  to the reason  $x$  is NOT in  $M$ .
3. Looked at **INVERSE IMAGES** of that map.
4. Either:  
All INVERSE IMG's are small, so use LEMMA.  
OR  
Some INVERSE IMG's are large subsets of  $\mathbb{R}^d$  or  $\mathbb{S}^d$ , so induct.

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.



## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}.$$

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}.$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ?

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ .

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!



## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ .

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ?

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ .

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ .

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4, x_5\})$ ?

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}$ .

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4, x_5\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

## Area- $d = 3$ Case

**Thm:** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^3$  of size  $n$ , no three colinear, there exists Area-rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^\delta)$ . ( $\delta$  TBD)

**Proof:** Let  $M$  be a **MAXIMAL AREA-RAINBOW SET**.

Let  $x \in X - M$ . WHY IS  $x$  NOT IN  $M$ !? Either

- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_3)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)]$ .
- ▶  $(\exists x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5 \in M)[\text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x_3, x_4, x_5)]$ .

$f$  maps an element of  $X - M$  to **reason**  $x \notin M$ .

$$f : X - M \rightarrow \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{2} \cup \binom{M}{2} \times \binom{M}{3}.$$

What is  $f^{-1}(\{\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_1, x_3\}\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What is  $f^{-1}(\{x_1, x_2\}, \{x_3, x_4, x_5\})$ ? THIS IS HARD!

What to do?

# WHAT CHANGED?

Why is this proof harder?

**KEY** statement about prior proof:

# WHAT CHANGED?

Why is this proof harder?

**KEY** statement about prior proof:

1. If INVERSE IMG's are all finite so  $M$  is large.

# WHAT CHANGED?

Why is this proof harder?

**KEY** statement about prior proof:

1. If INVERSE IMG's are all finite so  $M$  is large.
2. If INVERSE IMG's are subsets of  $\mathbb{R}^d$  or  $\mathbb{S}^d$  then induct.



# WHAT CHANGED?

Why is this proof harder?

**KEY** statement about prior proof:

1. If INVERSE IMG's are all finite so  $M$  is large.
2. If INVERSE IMG's are subsets of  $\mathbb{R}^d$  or  $\mathbb{S}^d$  then induct.

**KEY:** We cared about  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  but had to work with  $\mathbb{S}^d$  as well.  
NOW we will have to work with more complicated objects.

# What Do Inverse Images Look Like?

$$\{x : \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)\} =$$

$$\{x : |\text{DET}(x, x_1, x_2)| = |\text{DET}(x, x_3, x_4)|\}.$$

# What Do Inverse Images Look Like?

$$\{x : \text{AREA}(x, x_1, x_2) = \text{AREA}(x, x_3, x_4)\} =$$

$$\{x : |\text{DET}(x, x_1, x_2)| = |\text{DET}(x, x_3, x_4)|\}.$$

**Def:** (Informally) An **Algebraic Variety in  $\mathbb{R}^d$**  is a set of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  that satisfy a polynomial equation in  $d$  variables.

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2^a-1)d})$ .

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a 2-rainbow set (dist. distances) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a 2-rainbow set (dist. distances) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 3-rainbow set (dist. areas) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5d})$ .

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a 2-rainbow set (dist. distances) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 3-rainbow set (dist. areas) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 4-rainbow set (dist. volumes) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/7d})$ .

## Comments on the Proof



# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a 2-rainbow set (dist. distances) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 3-rainbow set (dist. areas) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 4-rainbow set (dist. volumes) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/7d})$ .

## Comments on the Proof

1. Proof uses Algebraic Geometry in Proj Space over  $\mathbb{C}$ .

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a 2-rainbow set (dist. distances) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 3-rainbow set (dist. areas) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 4-rainbow set (dist. volumes) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/7d})$ .

## Comments on the Proof

1. Proof uses Algebraic Geometry in Proj Space over  $\mathbb{C}$ .
2. Proof uses Maximal subsets in same way as easier proofs.

# General Thm

**Thm** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . Let  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ . For all varieties  $V$  of dim  $d$  and degree  $r$  for all sets of  $n$  points on  $V$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** Let  $2 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists an  $a$ -rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/(2a-1)d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a 2-rainbow set (dist. distances) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/3d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 3-rainbow set (dist. areas) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/5d})$ .

**Corollary** For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there is a 4-rainbow set (dist. volumes) of size  $\Omega(n^{1/7d})$ .

## Comments on the Proof

1. Proof uses Algebraic Geometry in Proj Space over  $\mathbb{C}$ .
2. Proof uses Maximal subsets in same way as easier proofs.
3. Proof is by induction on  $d$ .

# Open Questions

# Open Questions

1. Better Particular Results: e.g., want  
*for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .*

# Open Questions

1. Better Particular Results: e.g., want  
*for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .*
2. General Better Results: e.g., want  
*Let  $1 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/ad})$ .*

# Open Questions

1. Better Particular Results: e.g., want  
*for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .*
2. General Better Results: e.g., want  
*Let  $1 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/ad})$ .*
3. Get easier proofs of general theorem.

# Open Questions

1. Better Particular Results: e.g., want  
*for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .*
2. General Better Results: e.g., want  
*Let  $1 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/ad})$ .*
3. Get easier proofs of general theorem.
4. Find any nontrivial limits on what we can do. (Trivial:  $n^{1/d}$ ).



# Open Questions

1. Better Particular Results: e.g., want  
*for all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  of size  $n$ , there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/2})$ .*
2. General Better Results: e.g., want  
*Let  $1 \leq a \leq d + 1$ . For all  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^d$  of size  $n$  there exists a rainbow set of size  $\Omega(n^{1/ad})$ .*
3. Get easier proofs of general theorem.
4. Find any nontrivial limits on what we can do. (Trivial:  $n^{1/d}$ ).
5. Algorithmic aspects.